# Persistent Homology Computation and Discrete Morse Theory 

Ulderico Fugacci
Kaiserslautern University of Technology
Department of Computer Science

## Outline



## Outline



## Computing Persistent Homology

## Standard Algorithm: [Edelsbrunner et al. 2002; Zomorodian, Carlsson 2005]



## Computing Persistent Homology

Standard Algorithm:
[Edelsbrunner et al. 2002; Zomorodian, Carlsson 2005]


Compute a reduced boundary matrix for $\Sigma f$ from which easily read the persistence pairs

## Computing Persistent Homology

Given a filtered simplicial complex, let us consider its filtering function $f$ :

$$
f(\sigma):=\min \left\{p \mid \sigma \in \Sigma^{p}\right\}
$$

Conversely, $\Sigma^{p}:=\{\sigma \in \Sigma \mid f(\sigma) \leq p\}$

## Total Ordering on $\Sigma$ :



A sequence $\sigma_{1}, \sigma_{2}, \ldots, \sigma_{n}$ of the simplices of $\Sigma$ such that:

+ if $f\left(\sigma_{i}\right)<f\left(\sigma_{j}\right)$, then $i<j$
+ if $\sigma_{\mathrm{i}}$ is a proper face of $\sigma_{\mathrm{j}}$, then $i<j$


## Computing Persistent Homology

A possible choice:
Set $\sigma<\sigma^{\prime}$ if:

+ if $f(\sigma)<f\left(\sigma^{\prime}\right)$

+ if $f(\sigma)=f\left(\sigma^{\prime}\right)$ and $\operatorname{dim}(\sigma)<\operatorname{dim}\left(\sigma^{\prime}\right)$
+ if $f(\sigma)=f\left(\sigma^{\prime}\right)$ and $\operatorname{dim}(\sigma)=\operatorname{dim}\left(\sigma^{\prime}\right)$ and $\sigma$ precedes $\sigma^{\prime}$ with respect to the lexicographic order of their vertices


## Computing Persistent Homology

## Boundary Matrix:

A square matrix $M$ of size $n \times n$ defined by
$M_{i, j}:= \begin{cases}1 & \text { if } \sigma_{i} \text { is a face of } \sigma_{j} \text { s.t. } \operatorname{dim}\left(\sigma_{i}\right)=\operatorname{dim}\left(\sigma_{j}\right)-1 \\ 0 & \text { otherwise }\end{cases}$


## Computing Persistent Homology

## Reduced Matrix:

Given a non-null column $j$ of a boundary matrix $M$,

$$
\operatorname{low}(j):=\max \left\{i \mid M_{i, j} \neq 0\right\}
$$

A matrix $R$ is called reduced if, for each pair of nun-null columns $j_{1}, j_{2}$,

$$
\operatorname{low}\left(j_{1}\right) \neq \operatorname{low}\left(j_{2}\right)
$$

Equivalently, if low function is injective on its domain of definition

## Computing Persistent Homology

| $i \backslash j$ | 1 | 2 |  | 3 | 4 | 5 | 6 | 7 | 8 | 9 | 10 | 11 | 12 | 13 | 14 | 15 | 16 | 17 | 18 | 19 | 20 | 21 | 22 | 23 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 2 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 3 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 4 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  | 1 | 1 |  |  |  |  |  |
| 5 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |
| 6 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |
| 7 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |
| 8 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 9 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 10 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 11 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 12 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 13 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |
| 14 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 | 1 |  |  | 1 |  |
| 15 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |
| 16 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |
| 17 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |
| 18 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |
| 19 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 20 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 21 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 22 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |
| 23 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| low |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 4 | 6 | 7 | 5 | 7 |  |  |  |  | 13 | 14 | 14 | 15 | 16 | 14 | 22 |

$\operatorname{low}(10)=7=\operatorname{low}(12)$
$M$ is not reduced

## Computing Persistent Homology

## Reduction Algorithm:

$$
\begin{aligned}
& \text { Matrix } R=M \\
& \text { for } j=1, \ldots, n \text { do } \\
& \text { while } \exists j^{\prime \prime}<j \text { with } \operatorname{low}\left(j^{\prime}\right)=\operatorname{low}(j) \text { do } \\
& \quad R . \operatorname{column}(j)=R . \operatorname{column}(j)+R . \operatorname{column}\left(j^{\prime}\right) \\
& \text { endwhile } \\
& \text { endfor } \\
& \text { return } R
\end{aligned}
$$

Time Complexity:
At most $n^{2}$ column additions

$\mathrm{O}\left(n^{3}\right)$ in the worst case

| $i \backslash j$ | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 | 6 | 7 | 8 | 9 | 10 | 11 | 12 | 13 | 14 | 15 | 16 | 17 | 18 | 19 | 20 | 21 | 22 | 23 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 2 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 3 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 4 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  | 1 | 1 |  |  |  |  |  |
| 5 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |
| 6 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |
| 7 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |
| 8 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 9 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 10 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 11 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 12 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 13 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |
| 14 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 | 1 |  |  | 1 |  |
| 15 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |
| 16 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |
| 17 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |
| 18 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |
| 19 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 20 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 21 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 22 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |
| 23 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| low |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 4 | 6 | 7 | 5 | 7 |  |  |  |  | 13 | 14 | 14 | 15 | 16 | 14 | 22 |

Initialize $R$ to $M$, where
$M$ is the boundary matrix of $\Sigma^{f}$
expressed according with a total ordering of its simplices

Step 1:

$$
j<12
$$

| $i \backslash j$ | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 | 6 | 7 | 8 | 9 | 10 | 11 | 12 | 13 | 14 | 15 | 16 | 17 | 18 | 19 | 20 | 21 | 22 | 23 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 2 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 3 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 4 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  | 1 | 1 |  |  |  |  |  |
| 5 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |
| 6 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |
| 7 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |
| 8 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 9 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 10 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 11 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 12 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 13 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |
| 14 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 | 1 |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |
| 15 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  |
| 16 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |
| 17 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |
| 18 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |
| 19 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 20 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 21 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |
| 22 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 23 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| low |  |  |  |  |  |  | 4 | 6 | 7 | 5 | 7 |  |  |  |  | 13 | 14 | 14 | 15 | 16 | 14 | 22 |  |

For each $j<12$,
there is no $j^{\prime}<j$ such that

$$
\operatorname{low}\left(j^{\prime}\right)=\operatorname{low}(j)
$$

So, increase $\boldsymbol{j}$ by 1

Step 2:

| $i \backslash j$ | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 | 6 | 7 | 8 | 9 | 10 | 11 | 12 | 13 | 14 | 15 | 16 | 17 | 18 | 19 | 20 | 21 | 22 | 23 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 2 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 3 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 4 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  | 1 | 1 |  |  |  |  |  |
| 5 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |
| 6 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |
| 7 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |
| 8 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 9 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 10 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 11 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 12 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 13 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |
| 14 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 | 1 |  |  | 1 |  |  |
| 15 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |
| 16 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |
| 17 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |
| 18 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |
| 19 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 20 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 21 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 22 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |
| 23 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| $l o w$ |  |  |  |  |  |  | 4 | 6 | 7 | 5 | 7 |  |  |  |  | 13 | 14 | 14 | 15 | 16 | 14 | 22 |  |

For $j=12, \operatorname{low}(12)=7$

Step 2:

| $i \backslash j$ | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 | 6 | 7 | 8 | 9 | 10 | 11 | 12 | 13 | 14 | 15 | 16 | 17 | 18 | 19 | 20 | 21 | 22 | 23 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 2 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 3 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 4 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  | 1 | 1 |  |  |  |  |  |
| 5 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |
| 6 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |
| 7 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |
| 8 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 9 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 10 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 11 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 12 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 13 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |
| 14 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 | 1 |  |  | 1 |  |  |
| 15 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |
| 16 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |
| 17 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |
| 18 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |
| 19 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 20 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 21 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |
| 22 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 23 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| low |  |  |  |  |  |  | 4 | 6 | 7 | 5 | 7 |  |  |  |  | 13 | 14 | 14 | 15 | 16 | 14 | 22 |  |

For $j=12, \operatorname{low}(12)=7$
column $j^{\prime}=10$ is such that $\operatorname{low}\left(j^{\prime}\right)=\operatorname{low}(j)=7$
So, set
column $12:=$ column $12+$ column 10

## Step 2:

| $i \backslash j$ | 1 |  | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 |  | 6 | 7 | 8 | 9 | 10 | 11 | 12 | 13 | 14 | 15 | 16 | 17 | 18 | 19 | 20 | 21 | 22 | 23 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 2 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 3 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 4 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  | 1 | 1 |  |  |  |  |  |
| 5 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |
| 6 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |
| 7 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |
| 8 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 9 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 10 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 11 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 12 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 13 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |
| 14 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 | 1 |  |  | 1 |  |
| 15 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |
| 16 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |
| 17 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |
| 18 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |
| 19 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 20 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 21 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 22 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |
| 23 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| low |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 4 | 6 | 7 | 5 | 6 |  |  |  |  | 13 | 14 | 14 | 15 | 16 | 14 | 22 |

For $j=12, \operatorname{low}(12)=7$
column $j^{\prime}=10$ is such that $\operatorname{low}\left(j^{\prime}\right)=\operatorname{low}(j)=7$
So, set
column $12:=$ column $12+$ column $10 \longrightarrow \operatorname{low}(12)=6$

Step 2:

| $i \backslash j$ | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 | 6 | 7 | 8 | 9 | 10 | 11 | 12 | 13 | 14 | 15 | 16 | 17 | 18 | 19 | 20 | 21 | 22 | 23 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 2 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 3 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 4 |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  | 1 | 1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 5 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  |
| 6 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |
| 7 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |
| 8 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 9 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 10 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 11 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 12 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 13 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |
| 14 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 | 1 |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |
| 15 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  |
| 16 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |
| 17 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |
| 18 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |
| 19 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 20 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 21 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 22 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |
| 23 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| $l o w$ |  |  |  |  |  | 4 | 6 | 7 | 5 | 6 |  |  |  |  | 13 | 14 | 14 | 15 | 16 | 14 | 22 |  |  |

For $j=12, \operatorname{low}(12)=6$

Step 2:

| $i \backslash j$ | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 | 6 | 7 | 8 | 9 | 10 | 11 | 12 | 13 | 14 | 15 | 16 | 17 | 18 | 19 | 20 | 21 | 22 | 23 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 2 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 3 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 4 |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  | 1 | 1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 5 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  |
| 6 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |
| 7 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |
| 8 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 9 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 10 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 11 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 12 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 13 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |
| 14 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 | 1 |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |
| 15 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 16 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  |
| 17 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |
| 18 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |
| 19 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 20 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 21 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 22 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |
| 23 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 4 | 6 | 7 | 5 | 6 |  |  |  |  | 13 | 14 | 14 | 15 | 16 | 14 |
| $l o w$ | 22 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |

For $j=12, \operatorname{low}(12)=6$ column $j^{\prime}=9$ is such that $\operatorname{low}\left(j^{\prime}\right)=\operatorname{low}(j)=6$
So, set
column $12:=$ column $12+$ column 9

## Step 2:

| $i \backslash j$ | 1 |  | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 |  | 6 | 7 | 8 | 9 | 10 | 11 | 12 | 13 | 14 | 15 | 16 | 17 | 18 | 19 | 20 | 21 | 22 | 23 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 2 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 3 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 4 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  | 1 | 1 |  |  |  |  |  |
| 5 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |
| 6 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |
| 7 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |
| 8 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 9 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 10 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 11 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 12 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 13 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |
| 14 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 | 1 |  |  | 1 |  |
| 15 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |
| 16 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |
| 17 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |
| 18 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |
| 19 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 20 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 21 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 22 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |
| 23 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| low |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 4 | 6 | 7 | 5 | 3 |  |  |  |  | 13 | 14 | 14 | 15 | 16 | 14 | 22 |

For $j=12, \operatorname{low}(12)=6$
column $j^{\prime}=9$ is such that $\operatorname{low}\left(j^{\prime}\right)=\operatorname{low}(j)=6$
So, set
column $12:=$ column $12+$ column $9 \longrightarrow \operatorname{low}(12)=3$

## Step 2:

| $i \backslash j$ | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 | 6 | 7 | 8 | 9 | 10 | 11 | 12 | 13 | 14 | 15 | 16 | 17 | 18 | 19 | 20 | 21 | 22 | 23 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 2 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 3 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 4 |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  | 1 | 1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 5 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  |
| 6 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |
| 7 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |
| 8 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 9 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 10 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 11 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 12 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 13 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |
| 14 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 | 1 |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |
| 15 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 16 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  |
| 17 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |
| 18 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |
| 19 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 20 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 21 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 22 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |
| 23 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 4 | 6 | 7 | 5 | 3 |  |  |  |  | 13 | 14 | 14 | 15 | 16 |
| 14 | 14 | 22 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| $l o w$ |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |

For each $j=12$,
there is no $j^{\prime}<j$ such that
$\operatorname{low}\left(j^{\prime}\right)=\operatorname{low}(j)=3$
So, increase $\boldsymbol{j}$ by 1

$$
12<j<19
$$

| $i \backslash j$ | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 | 6 |  | 7 | 8 | 9 | 10 | 11 | 12 | 13 | 14 | 15 | 16 | 17 | 18 | 19 | 20 | 21 | 22 | 23 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 2 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 3 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 4 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  | 1 | 1 |  |  |  |  |  |
| 5 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |
| 6 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |
| 7 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |
| 8 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 9 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 10 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 11 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 12 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 13 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |
| 14 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 | 1 |  |  | 1 |  |
| 15 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |
| 16 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |
| 17 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |
| 18 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |
| 19 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 20 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 21 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 22 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |
| 23 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| low |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 4 | 6 | 7 | 5 | 3 |  |  |  |  | 13 | 14 | 14 | 15 | 16 | 14 | 22 |

For each $12<j<19$,
there is no $j^{\prime}<j$ such that

$$
\operatorname{low}\left(j^{\prime}\right)=\operatorname{low}(j)
$$

So, increase $\boldsymbol{j}$ by $\mathbf{1}$

Step 4:

| $i \backslash j$ | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 | 6 | 7 | 8 | 9 | 10 | 11 | 12 | 13 | 14 | 15 | 16 | 17 | 18 | 19 | 20 | 21 | 22 | 23 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 2 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 3 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 4 |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  | 1 | 1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 5 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  |
| 6 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |
| 7 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |
| 8 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 9 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 10 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 11 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 12 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 13 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |
| 14 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 | 1 |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |
| 15 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  |
| 16 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |
| 17 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |
| 18 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |
| 19 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 20 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 21 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 22 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |
| 23 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| $l o w$ |  |  |  |  |  | 4 | 6 | 7 | 5 | 3 |  |  |  |  | 13 | 14 | 14 | 15 | 16 | 14 | 22 |  |  |

For $j=19, \operatorname{low}(19)=14$

## Step 4:

| $i \backslash j$ | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 | 6 | 7 | 8 | 9 | 10 | 11 | 12 | 13 | 14 | 15 | 16 | 17 | 18 | 19 | 20 | 21 | 22 | 23 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 2 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 3 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 4 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  | 1 | 1 |  |  |  |  |  |
| 5 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |
| 6 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |
| 7 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |
| 8 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 9 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 10 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 11 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 12 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 13 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |
| 14 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 | 1 |  |  | 1 |  |
| 15 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |
| 16 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |
| 17 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |
| 18 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |
| 19 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 20 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 21 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 22 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |
| 23 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| low |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 4 | 6 | 7 | 5 | 3 |  |  |  |  | 13 | 14 | 14 | 15 | 16 | 14 | 22 |

For $j=19, \operatorname{low}(19)=14$ column $j^{\prime}=18$ is such that $\operatorname{low}\left(j^{\prime}\right)=\operatorname{low}(j)=14$
So, set
column $19:=$ column $19+$ column 18

## Step 4:

| $i \backslash j$ | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 | 6 | 7 | 8 | 9 | 10 | 11 | 12 | 13 | 14 | 15 | 16 | 17 | 18 | 19 | 20 | 21 | 22 | 23 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 2 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 3 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 4 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  | 1 | 1 | 1 |  |  |  |  |
| 5 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |
| 6 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |
| 7 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |
| 8 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 9 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 10 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 11 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 12 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 13 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |
| 14 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  | 1 |  |
| 15 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |
| 16 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |
| 17 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |
| 18 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |
| 19 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 20 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 21 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 22 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |
| 23 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| low |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 4 | 6 | 7 | 5 | 3 |  |  |  |  | 13 | 14 | 5 | 15 | 16 | 14 | 22 |

For $j=19, \operatorname{low}(19)=14$ column $j^{\prime}=18$ is such that $\operatorname{low}\left(j^{\prime}\right)=\operatorname{low}(j)=14$
So, set
column $19:=$ column $19+$ column $18 \longrightarrow$ low $(\mathbf{1 9 )}=5$

Step 4:

| $i \backslash j$ | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 | 6 | 7 | 8 | 9 | 10 | 11 | 12 | 13 | 14 | 15 | 16 | 17 | 18 | 19 | 20 | 21 | 22 | 23 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 2 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 3 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 4 |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  | 1 | 1 | 1 |  |  |  |  |  |
| 5 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  |
| 6 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |
| 7 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |
| 8 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 9 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 10 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 11 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 12 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 13 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |
| 14 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |
| 15 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  |
| 16 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |
| 17 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |
| 18 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |
| 19 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 20 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 21 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 22 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |
| 23 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| $l o w$ |  |  |  |  |  | 4 | 6 | 7 | 5 | 3 |  |  |  |  | 13 | 14 | 5 | 15 | 16 | 14 | 22 |  |  |

For $j=19, \operatorname{low}(19)=5$

## Step 4:

| $i \backslash j$ | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 | 6 | 7 | 8 | 9 | 10 | 11 | 12 | 13 | 14 | 15 | 16 | 17 | 18 | 19 | 20 | 21 | 22 | 23 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 2 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 3 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 4 |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  | 1 | 1 | 1 |  |  |  |  |  |
| 5 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  |
| 6 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |
| 7 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |
| 8 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 9 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 10 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 11 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 12 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 13 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |
| 14 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |
| 15 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 16 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  |
| 17 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |
| 18 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |
| 19 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 20 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 21 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 22 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |
| 23 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| $l o w$ |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 10 |  |  |  |  |  | 4 | 6 | 7 | 5 | 3 |  |  |  |  | 13 | 14 | 5 | 15 | 16 | 14 | 22 |  |  |

For $j=19, \operatorname{low}(19)=5$ column $j^{\prime}=11$ is such that $\operatorname{low}\left(j^{\prime}\right)=\operatorname{low}(j)=5$
So, set
column $19:=$ column $19+$ column 11

## Step 4:

| $i \backslash j$ | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 | 6 | 7 | 8 | 9 | 10 | 11 | 12 | 13 | 14 | 15 | 16 | 17 | 18 | 19 | 20 | 21 | 22 | 23 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 2 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 3 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 4 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  | 1 | 1 |  |  |  |  |  |
| 5 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 6 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |
| 7 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |
| 8 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 9 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 10 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 11 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 12 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 13 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |
| 14 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  | 1 |  |
| 15 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |
| 16 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |
| 17 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |
| 18 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |
| 19 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 20 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 21 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 22 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |
| 23 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| low |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 4 | 6 | 7 | 5 | 3 |  |  |  |  | 13 | 14 |  | 15 | 16 | 14 | 22 |

For $j=19, \operatorname{low}(19)=5$ column $j^{\prime}=11$ is such that $\operatorname{low}\left(j^{\prime}\right)=\operatorname{low}(j)=5$
So, set
column $19:=$ column $19+$ column $11 \longrightarrow$ low(19) undefined

## Step 4:

| $i \backslash j$ | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 | 6 | 7 | 8 | 9 | 10 | 11 | 12 | 13 | 14 | 15 | 16 | 17 | 18 | 19 | 20 | 21 | 22 | 23 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 2 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 3 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 4 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  | 1 | 1 |  |  |  |  |  |
| 5 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 6 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |
| 7 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |
| 8 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 9 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 10 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 11 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 12 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 13 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |
| 14 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  | 1 |  |
| 15 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |
| 16 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |
| 17 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |
| 18 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |
| 19 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 20 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 21 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 22 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |
| 23 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| low |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 4 | 6 | 7 | 5 | 3 |  |  |  |  | 13 | 14 |  | 15 | 16 | 14 | 22 |

For each $j=19$,
there is no $j^{\prime}<j$ such that

$$
\operatorname{low}\left(j^{\prime}\right)=\operatorname{low}(j)
$$

So, increase $\boldsymbol{j}$ by 1

## Step 5:

$19<j<22$

| $i \backslash j$ | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 | 6 | 7 | 8 | 9 | 10 | 11 | 12 | 13 | 14 | 15 | 16 | 17 | 18 | 19 | 20 | 21 | 22 | 23 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 2 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 3 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 4 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  | 1 | 1 |  |  |  |  |  |
| 5 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 6 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |
| 7 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |
| 8 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 9 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 10 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 11 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 12 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 13 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |
| 14 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |
| 15 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |
| 16 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |
| 17 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |
| 18 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |
| 19 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 20 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 21 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |
| 22 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 23 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| low |  |  |  |  |  |  | 4 | 6 | 7 | 5 | 3 |  |  |  |  | 13 | 14 |  | 15 | 16 | 14 | 22 |  |

For each $19<j<22$,
there is no $j^{\prime}<j$ such that
$\operatorname{low}\left(j^{\prime}\right)=\operatorname{low}(j)$
So, increase $\boldsymbol{j}$ by 1

Step 6:

| $i \backslash j$ | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 | 6 | 7 | 8 | 9 | 10 | 11 | 12 | 13 | 14 | 15 | 16 | 17 | 18 | 19 | 20 | 21 | 22 | 23 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 2 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 3 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 4 |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  | 1 | 1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 5 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 6 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |
| 7 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |
| 8 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 9 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 10 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 11 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 12 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 13 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |
| 14 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |
| 15 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  |
| 16 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |
| 17 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |
| 18 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |
| 19 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 20 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 21 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 22 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |
| 23 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| $l o w$ |  |  |  |  |  | 4 | 6 | 7 | 5 | 3 |  |  |  |  | 13 | 14 |  | 15 | 16 | 14 | 22 |  |  |

For $j=22, \operatorname{low}(22)=14$

## Step 6:

| $i \backslash j$ | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 | 6 | 7 | 8 | 9 | 10 | 11 | 12 | 13 | 14 | 15 | 16 | 17 | 18 | 19 | 20 | 21 | 22 | 23 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 2 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 3 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 4 |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  | 1 | 1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 5 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 6 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |
| 7 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |
| 8 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 9 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 10 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 11 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 12 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 13 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |
| 14 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |
| 15 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 16 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  |
| 17 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |
| 18 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |
| 19 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 20 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 21 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 22 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |
| 23 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| $l o w$ |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 10 |  |  |  |  |  | 4 | 6 | 7 | 5 | 3 |  |  |  |  | 13 | 14 |  | 15 | 16 | 14 | 22 |  |  |

For $j=22, \operatorname{low}(22)=14$
column $j^{\prime}=18$ is such that $\operatorname{low}\left(j^{\prime}\right)=\operatorname{low}(j)=14$
So, set
column $22:=$ column $22+$ column 18

## Step 6:

| $i \backslash j$ | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 | 6 | 7 | 8 | 9 | 10 | 11 | 12 | 13 | 14 | 15 | 16 | 17 | 18 | 19 | 20 | 21 | 22 | 23 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 2 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 3 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 4 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  | 1 | 1 |  |  |  | 1 |  |
| 5 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 6 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |
| 7 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |
| 8 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 9 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 10 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 11 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 12 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |
| 13 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |
| 14 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 15 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |
| 16 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |
| 17 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |
| 18 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |
| 19 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 20 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 21 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |
| 22 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 23 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| low |  |  |  |  |  |  | 4 | 6 | 7 | 5 | 3 |  |  |  |  | 13 | 14 |  | 15 | 16 | 13 | 22 |  |

For $j=22, \operatorname{low}(22)=14$
column $j^{\prime}=18$ is such that $\operatorname{low}\left(j^{\prime}\right)=\operatorname{low}(j)=14$
So, set
column $22:=$ column $22+$ column $18 \longrightarrow$ loww $(22)=13$

Step 6:

| $i \backslash j$ | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 | 6 | 7 | 8 | 9 | 10 | 11 | 12 | 13 | 14 | 15 | 16 | 17 | 18 | 19 | 20 | 21 | 22 | 23 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 2 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 3 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 4 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  | 1 | 1 |  |  |  | 1 |  |
| 5 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 6 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |
| 7 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |
| 8 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 9 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 10 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 11 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 12 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |
| 13 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |
| 14 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 15 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |
| 16 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |
| 17 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |
| 18 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |
| 19 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 20 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 21 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |
| 22 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 23 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| low |  |  |  |  |  |  | 4 | 6 | 7 | 5 | 3 |  |  |  |  | 13 | 14 |  | 15 | 16 | 13 | 22 |  |

For $j=22, \operatorname{low}(22)=13$

## Step 6:

| $i \backslash j$ | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 | 6 | 7 | 8 | 9 | 10 | 11 | 12 | 13 | 14 | 15 | 16 | 17 | 18 | 19 | 20 | 21 | 22 | 23 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 2 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 3 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 4 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  | 1 | 1 |  |  |  | 1 |  |
| 5 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 6 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |
| 7 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |
| 8 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 9 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 10 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 11 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 12 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 13 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |
| 14 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 15 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |
| 16 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |
| 17 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |
| 18 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |
| 19 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 20 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 21 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |
| 22 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 23 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| $l o w$ |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 4 | 6 | 7 | 5 | 3 |  |  |  |  | 13 | 14 |  | 15 | 16 | 13 | 22 |

For $j=22, \operatorname{low}(22)=13$
column $j^{\prime}=17$ is such that $\operatorname{low}\left(j^{\prime}\right)=\operatorname{low}(j)=13$
So, set
column 22 := column $22+$ column 17

## Step 6:

| $i \backslash j$ | 1 | 2 |  | 3 | 4 | 5 | 6 | 7 | 8 | 9 | 10 | 11 | 12 | 13 | 14 | 15 | 16 | 17 | 18 | 19 | 20 | 21 | 22 | 23 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 2 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 3 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 4 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  | 1 | 1 |  |  |  |  |  |
| 5 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 6 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |
| 7 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |
| 8 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 9 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 10 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 11 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 12 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 13 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 14 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  |
| 15 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |
| 16 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |
| 17 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |
| 18 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |
| 19 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 20 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 21 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 22 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |
| 23 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| low |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 4 | 6 | 7 | 5 | 3 |  |  |  |  | 13 | 14 |  | 15 | 16 |  | 22 |

For $j=22, \operatorname{low}(22)=13$
column $j^{\prime}=17$ is such that $\operatorname{low}\left(j^{\prime}\right)=\operatorname{low}(j)=13$
So, set
column $22:=$ column $22+$ column $17 \longrightarrow$ low(22) undefined

## Step 6:

| $i \backslash j$ | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 | 6 | 7 | 8 | 9 | 10 | 11 | 12 | 13 | 14 | 15 | 16 | 17 | 18 | 19 | 20 | 21 | 22 | 23 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 2 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 3 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 4 |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  | 1 | 1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 5 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 6 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |
| 7 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |
| 8 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 9 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 10 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 11 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 12 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 13 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 14 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 15 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 16 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  |
| 17 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |
| 18 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |
| 19 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 20 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 21 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 22 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |
| 23 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| $l o w$ |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 10 |  |  |  |  |  | 4 | 6 | 7 | 5 | 3 |  |  |  |  | 13 | 14 |  | 15 | 16 |  | 22 |  |  |

For each $j=22$,
there is no $j^{\prime}<j$ such that

$$
\operatorname{low}\left(j^{\prime}\right)=\operatorname{low}(j)
$$

So, increase $\boldsymbol{j}$ by 1

## Step 7:

| $i \backslash j$ | 1 | 2 | 3 | 3 | 4 | 5 | 6 | 7 | 8 | 8 | 9 | 10 | 11 | 12 | 13 | 14 | 15 | 16 | 17 | 18 | 19 | 20 | 21 | 22 | 23 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 | 1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 2 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 3 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 4 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 | 1 |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  | 1 | 1 |  |  |  |  |  |
| 5 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 6 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |
| 7 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |
| 8 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 9 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 10 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 11 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 12 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 13 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 14 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  |
| 15 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |
| 16 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |
| 17 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |
| 18 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |
| 19 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 20 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 21 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 22 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |
| 23 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| low |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 4 | 6 | 7 | 5 | 3 |  |  |  |  | 13 | 1 |  | 15 | 16 |  | 22 |

For each $j=23$,
there is no $j^{\prime}<j$ such that

$$
\operatorname{low}\left(j^{\prime}\right)=\operatorname{low}(j)=22
$$

So, matrix $R$ is reduced

## Output:

| $i \backslash j$ | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 | 6 | 7 | 8 | 9 | 10 | 11 | 12 | 13 | 14 | 15 | 16 | 17 | 18 | 19 | 20 | 21 | 22 | 23 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 2 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 3 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 4 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  | 1 | 1 |  |  |  |  |  |
| 5 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 6 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |
| 7 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |
| 8 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 9 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 10 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 11 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 12 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 13 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 14 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  |
| 15 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |
| 16 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |
| 17 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |
| 18 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |
| 19 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 20 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 21 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 22 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |
| 23 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| low |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 4 | 6 | 7 | 5 | 3 |  |  |  |  | 13 | 14 |  | 15 | 16 |  | 22 |

The algorithm returns the above reduced matrix $R$

## Computing Persistent Homology

## Retrieving Persistence Pairs:

+ For each $i=0, \ldots, n$,
if there exists $j$ such that $\operatorname{low}(j)=i$

$[i, j]$ is a pair for $R$
+ Once every $i$ has been parsed, if $i$ is an unpaired value
 $[i, \infty)$ is a pair for $R$

From pairs of $R$ to the "actual" persistence pairs of $\Sigma f$ :
$[i, j]$ corresponds to $\left[f\left(\sigma_{i}\right), f\left(\sigma_{j}\right)\right.$ ]
$[i, \infty)$ corresponds to $\left[f\left(\sigma_{i}\right), \infty\right)$
$\left(\right.$ homological degree $\left.=\operatorname{dim}\left(\sigma_{i}\right)\right)$

## Computing Persistent Homology

$H_{0}$ $[1, \infty)$ $[2, \infty)$ [3, 12]
[4, 8]
$[5,11]$
[6, 9]
[7, 10]
[13, 17]
[14, 18]
[15, 20]
[16, 21]
$H_{1}$
$[19, \infty)$
[22, 23]

| $i \backslash j$ | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 | 6 | 7 | 8 | 9 | 10 | 11 | 12 | 13 | 14 | 15 | 16 | 17 | 18 | 19 | 20 | 21 | 22 | 23 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 2 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 3 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 4 |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  | 1 | 1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 5 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 6 |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  |
| 7 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |
| 8 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 9 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 10 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 11 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 12 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 13 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 14 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 15 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  |
| 16 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |  |  |
| 17 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |  |
| 18 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |
| 19 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 20 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 21 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| 22 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  | 1 |  |  |
| 23 |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| $l o w$ |  |  |  |  |  |  | 4 | 6 | 7 | 5 | 3 |  |  |  |  | 13 | 14 |  | 15 | 16 | 22 |  |  |

## Computing Persistent Homology



## Computing Persistent Homology

Standard algorithm to compute (persistent) homology [Zomorodian, Carlsson 2005]:

+ Based on a matrix reduction
+ Linear complexity in practical cases
+ Quadratic complexity in the worst case


## Several different strategies:

## Direct approaches

+ Zigzag persistent homology [Milosavljević et al. '05]
+ Computation with a twist [Chen, Kerber '11]
+ Dual algorithm [De Silvia et al. '11]
+ Output-sensitive algorithm [Chen, Kerber '13]
+ Multi-field algorithm [Boissonnat, Maria '14]
- Annotation-based methods [Boissonnat et al. '13; Dey et al. '14]


## Distributed approaches

+ Spectral sequences [Edelsbrunner, Harer '08; Lipsky et al. '11]
+ Constructive Mayer-Vietoris [Boltcheva et al. '11]
+ Multicore coreductions [Murty et al. '13]
+ Multicore homology [Lewis, Zomorodian '14]
+ Persistent homology in chunks [Bauer et al. '14a]
* Distributed persistent computation [Bauer et al. '14b]


## Coarsening approaches

+ Topological operators and simplifications [Mrozek, Wanner '10; Dlotko, Wagner '14]
+ Morse-based approaches [Robins et al. '11; Harker et al. '14; Fugacci et al. '14]


## Computing Persistent Homology

## Direct approaches:

+ Zigzag persistent homology [Milosavljević et al. ’05]
+ Computation with a twist [Chen, Kerber '11]
+ Dual algorithm [De Silvia et al. '11]
+ Output-sensitive algorithm [Chen, Kerber '13]
+ Multi-field algorithm [Boissonnat, Maria '14]
+ Annotation-based methods [Boissonnat et al. '13; Dey et al. '14]


## Computing Persistent Homology

## Distributed approaches:

+ Spectral sequences [Edelsbrunner, Harer '08; Lipsky et al. '11]
+ Constructive Mayer-Vietoris [Boltcheva et al. '11]
+ Multicore coreductions [Murty et al. '13]
+ Multicore homology [Lewis, Zomorodian '14]
+ Persistent homology in chunks [Bauer et al. '14a]
+ Distributed persistent computation [Bauer et al. '14b]



## Computing Persistent Homology

Coarsening approaches:

+ Topological operators and simplifications [Dlotko, Wagner '14]



## Computing Persistent Homology

Coarsening approaches:

+ Topological operators and simplifications [Dlotko, Wagner '14]
- Acyclic Subcomplexes [Mrozek et al. ‘08]



## Computing Persistent Homology

Coarsening approaches:

+ Topological operators and simplifications [Dlotko, Wagner '14]
- Acyclic Subcomplexes [Mrozek et al. '08]
- Reductions and Coreductions [Mrozek et al. '10]



## Computing Persistent Homology

Coarsening approaches:

+ Topological operators and simplifications [Dlotko, Wagner '14]
- Acyclic Subcomplexes [Mrozek et al. ‘08]
- Reductions and Coreductions [Mrozek et al. '10]
- Edge Contractions [Attali et al. '11]



## Computing Persistent Homology

Coarsening approaches:

+ Topological operators and simplifications [Dlotko, Wagner '14]
- Acyclic Subcomplexes [Mrozek et al. ‘08]
- Reductions and Coreductions [Mrozek et al. '10]
- Edge Contractions [Attali et al. '11]
+ Morse-based approaches [Robins et al. '11; Harker et al. '14; Fugacci et al. '14]


## Outline



## Morse Theory [Milnor 1963, Matsumoto 2002]

+ Topological tool for efficiently analyzing a shape by studying the behavior of a smooth scalar function $f$ defined on it
- Relates the critical points of a smooth scalar function on a shape with their regions of influence
+ Analysis of scalar fields requires extracting morphological features (e.g.,
 critical points, integral lines and surfaces)


## Morse Theory

Let $f$ be a real-valued $\mathrm{C}^{2}$-function defined on a $d$-dimensional manifold $M$

+ Critical point of $f$ : any point on $M$ in which the gradient of $f$ vanishes

Non-degenerate critical point


+ Critical points can be degenerate or non-degenerate
- A critical point $p$ is degenerate iff the determinant the Hessian matrix $H$ of the second order derivatives of function $f$ is null

Function $f$ is a Morse function if and only if all its critical points are non-degenerate

Degenerate critical points (monkey saddle and flat saddle)


## Morse Theory

Critical points of a Morse function are isolated


Examples of non-Morse functions

- A $d$-dimensional Morse function $f$ has $d+1$ types of critical points, called $i$-saddles ( $i$ is the index of the critical point)
- For $d=2$ : minima, saddles and maxima
- For $d=3$ : minima, 1 -saddles, 2- saddles and maxima

Critical points of a 2D function


## Morse Theory

* An integral line of a smooth function $f$ is a maximal path which is everywhere tangent to the gradient vector field of $f$
+ Integral lines start and end at the critical points of $f$
+ Integral lines that connect critical points of consecutive index are called separatrix lines



## Morse Theory

+ Integral lines that converge to a critical point $p$ of index $i$ form an $i$-cell called the descending cell of $p$
- Descending cell of a maximum: 2-cell
- Descending cell of a saddle: 1-cell
- Descending cell of a minimum: 0-cell



## Descending Morse Complex:

Collection of the descending cells of all critical points of function $f$

## Morse Theory

+ Integral lines that converge to a critical point $p$ of index $i$ form an $i$-cell called the descending cell of $p$
- Descending cell of a maximum: 2-cell
- Descending cell of a saddle: 1-cell
- Descending cell of a minimum: 0-cell



## Descending Morse Complex:

Collection of the descending cells of all critical points of function $f$

## Morse Theory

+ Integral lines that converge to a critical point $p$ of index $i$ form an $i$-cell called the descending cell of $p$
- Descending cell of a maximum: 2-cell
- Descending cell of a saddle: 1-cell
- Descending cell of a minimum: 0-cell



## Descending Morse Complex:

Collection of the descending cells of all critical points of function $f$

## Morse Theory

+ Integral lines that converge to a critical point $p$ of index $i$ form an $i$-cell called the descending cell of $p$
- Descending cell of a maximum: 2-cell
- Descending cell of a saddle: 1-cell
- Descending cell of a minimum: 0-cell


## Descending Morse Complex:

Collection of the descending cells of all critical points of function $f$


## Morse Theory

+ Integral lines that originate at a critical point $p$ of index $i$ form a ( $d-i$ )-cell called the ascending cell of $p$
- Ascending cell of a minimum: 2-cell
- Ascending cell of a saddle: 1-cell
- Ascending cell of a maximum: 0-cell


## Ascending Morse Complex:



Collection of the ascending cells of all critical points of function $f$

## Morse Theory

+ Integral lines that originate at a critical point $p$ of index $i$ form a ( $d-i$ )-cell called the ascending cell of $p$
- Ascending cell of a minimum: 2-cell
- Ascending cell of a saddle: 1-cell
- Ascending cell of a maximum: 0-cell


## Ascending Morse Complex:



Collection of the ascending cells of all critical points of function $f$

## Morse Theory

+ Integral lines that originate at a critical point $p$ of index $i$ form a ( $d-i$ )-cell called the ascending cell of $p$
- Ascending cell of a minimum: 2-cell
- Ascending cell of a saddle: 1-cell
- Ascending cell of a maximum: 0-cell


## Ascending Morse Complex:

Collection of the ascending cells of all critical points of function $f$

## Morse Theory

+ Integral lines that originate at a critical point $p$ of index $i$ form a ( $d-i$ )-cell called the ascending cell of $p$
- Ascending cell of a minimum: 2-cell
- Ascending cell of a saddle: 1-cell
- Ascending cell of a maximum: 0-cell


## Ascending Morse Complex:

Collection of the ascending cells of all critical points of function $f$


## Morse Theory

* Function $f$ is a Morse-Smale function if its ascending and descending Morse cells intersect transversally

* Morse-Smale (MS) complex is the complex obtained from the mutual intersection of all the ascending and descending cells



## Morse Theory

+ In a 2D Morse-Smale complex:
- a 2-cell is a quadrilateral bounded by the sequence maximum - saddle - minimum - saddle

+ In a 3D Morse-Smale complex:
+ each 1-saddle is connected to exactly two minima
+ each 2-saddle is connected to exactly two maxima



## Discrete Morse Theory

## Morse Theory:

Enables to analyze the topology of a shape by studying functions defined on it


Various discretizations of Morse theory:

+ Piecewise linear Morse theory [Banchoff '67]
+ Watershed transform [Meyer '94]
+ Discrete Morse theory [Forman '98]


## Discrete Morse Theory

## Combinatorial counterpart of Morse theory:

* Introduced for cell complexes

* Gives a compact homology-equivalent model for a shape
* Derivative free tool for computing segmentations of shapes



## Discrete Morse Theory

## Discrete Morse Theory:

Gradient of a function is simulated by a matching $V$ of the simplices in $\Sigma$
A matching $V$ is a collection of pairs $(\sigma, \tau)$ such that:

+ $\sigma, \tau$ are incident simplices of dimension $k$ and $k+1$
+ each simplex of $\Sigma$ is in at most one pair of $V$



## Discrete Morse Theory

## Discrete Morse Theory:

Gradient of a function is simulated by a matching $V$ of the simplices in $\Sigma$

A matching $V$ is a collection of pairs $(\sigma, \tau)$ such that:

+ $\sigma, \tau$ are incident simplices of dimension $k$ and $k+1$
+ each simplex of $\Sigma$ is in at most one pair of $V$
$V$-path: Sequence of pairs of $V$

$$
\left(\sigma_{1}, \tau_{1}\right),\left(\sigma_{2}, \tau_{2}\right), \ldots,\left(\sigma_{r-1}, \tau_{r-1}\right),\left(\sigma_{r}, \tau_{r}\right)
$$

such that

+ $\sigma_{i+1}$ is a $k$-simplex face of the $(k+1)$-simplex $\tau_{i}$
- $\sigma_{i+1}$ is different from $\sigma_{i}$


A matching $V$ is called Forman gradient if it is free of closed $V$-paths

## Discrete Morse Theory

Unpaired simplices of dimension $k$ are denoted as critical simplices of index $k$

## Discrete Morse Complex:

A chain complex whose:

+ $k$-cells $\longleftrightarrow$ critical simplices of index $k$
+ boundary relations are induced by $V$-paths


## Theorem.

Given a Forman gradient $V$ defined on a simplicial complex $\Sigma$, the associated discrete Morse complex is homologically equivalent to $\Sigma$

## Discrete Morse Theory

## Filtered Forman Gradient:

Given a filtration $F$ of a simplicial complex $\Sigma$, a Forman gradient $V$ is a filtered Forman gradient of $F$ if, for each pair $(\sigma, \tau) \in V$, there exists $p$ such that $\sigma, \tau \in \Sigma^{p}$ and $\sigma, \tau \notin \Sigma^{p-1}$

Filtration F naturally induces a filtration on the discrete Morse Complex

## Theorem.

If $V$ is a filtered Forman gradient of $F$, then $\Sigma$ and the associated discrete Morse complex have isomorphic persistent homology

## Discrete Morse Theory

Let $\Sigma$ be a simplicial complex of dimension $d$


## Discrete Morse Theory

Let $\Sigma$ be a simplicial complex of dimension $d$


Navigating the $V$-paths, one can retrieve:

+ Descending Morse complex $\Gamma_{D}$
- generated by collection of the $d$-cells representing the regions of influence of the maxima of $f: k$-cells of $\Gamma_{D} \longleftrightarrow$ critical simplices of index $k$


## Discrete Morse Theory

Let $\Sigma$ be a simplicial complex of dimension $d$


Navigating the $V$-paths, one can retrieve:

+ Ascending Morse complex $\Gamma_{A}$
- generated by collection of the $d$-cells representing the regions of influence of the minima of $f:(d-k)$-cells of $\Gamma_{A} \longleftrightarrow$ critical simplices of index $k$


## Discrete Morse Theory

Let $\Sigma$ be a simplicial complex of dimension $d$


Navigating the $V$-paths, one can retrieve:

+ Morse-Smale complex $\boldsymbol{\Gamma}_{M S}$
- generated by the connected components of the intersection of the cells of the descending and ascending Morse complexes


## Morse Theory

## Algorithms for computing Morse complexes:

## Boundary-based

+ Triangle meshes [Takahashi et al. '95; Edelsbrunner et al. '01; Bremer et al. '04]
- Tetrahedral meshes [Edelsbrunner et al. '03]
+ Regular grids [Bajaj et al. '98; Schneider '04; Schneider '05]
Region-growing
- Adding triangles [Magillo et al. '99; Danovaro et al. '03]
- Adding vertices [Gyulassy et al. '07]


## Watershed

+ Topographic distance [Meyer et al. '90; Meyer '94]
+ Simulated immersion [Vincent et al. '91; Soille '04]
+ Rain falling simulation [Mangan et al. '99; Stove et al. '00]
Forman-based

+ Constrained approaches [Cazals et al. '03; King et al. '05; Gyulassy et al. '08; Robins et al. '11; Gyulassy et al. '12]
+ Unconstrained approaches [Lewiner et al. '03; Benedetti et al. '14; Harker et al. '14]
* Gradient traversal [Gunther et al. '12; Shivashankarar et al. '12; Weiss et al. '13]


## Discrete Morse Theory

A (filtered) Forman gradient can be build by using the homology-preserving operators of reduction and coreduction

## Reduction and Coreduction Operators:

Let $\sigma, \tau$ be two incident simplices of dimension $k$ and $k+1$, respectively
Pair $(\sigma, \tau)$ is called:

Reduction if
immediate coboundary of $\sigma=\{\tau\}$


Coreduction if
immediate boundary of $\tau=\{\sigma\}$


## Discrete Morse Theory

## Gradient through Reductions: <br> [Benedetti et al. 2014]

Input: $\Sigma$ simplicial complex
Output: $V$ gradient vector field, A set of critical simplices

Set $\Sigma^{\prime} \leftarrow \Sigma, V \leftarrow \varnothing, A \leftarrow \varnothing$
while $\Sigma^{\prime} \neq \varnothing$ do
while $\Sigma$ ' admits a reduction pair $(\sigma, T)$ do
$V \leftarrow V \cup\{(\sigma, T)\}$
$\Sigma^{\prime} \leftarrow \Sigma^{\prime} \backslash\{\sigma, T\}$
end while

Let $\eta$ be a top simplex in $\Sigma^{\prime}$

$$
\begin{aligned}
& A \leftarrow A \cup\{\eta\} \\
& \Sigma^{\prime} \leftarrow \Sigma^{\prime} \backslash\{\eta\}
\end{aligned}
$$


end while

## Discrete Morse Theory

## Gradient through Reductions: <br> [Benedetti et al. 2014]

Input: $\Sigma$ simplicial complex
Output: V gradient vector field, A set of critical simplices

Set $\Sigma^{\prime} \leftarrow \Sigma, V \leftarrow \varnothing, A \leftarrow \varnothing$
while $\Sigma^{\prime} \neq \varnothing$ do
while $\Sigma$ ' admits a reduction pair $(\sigma, T)$ do
$V \leftarrow V \cup\{(\sigma, T)\}$
$\Sigma^{\prime} \leftarrow \Sigma^{\prime} \backslash\{\sigma, T\}$
end while

Let $\eta$ be a top simplex in $\Sigma^{\prime}$

$$
\begin{aligned}
& A \leftarrow A \cup\{\eta\} \\
& \Sigma^{\prime} \leftarrow \Sigma^{\prime} \backslash\{\eta\}
\end{aligned}
$$


end while

## Discrete Morse Theory

## Gradient through Reductions: <br> [Benedetti et al. 2014]

Input: $\sum$ simplicial complex
Output: V gradient vector field, A set of critical simplices

Set $\Sigma^{\prime} \leftarrow \Sigma, V \leftarrow \varnothing, A \leftarrow \varnothing$
while $\Sigma^{\prime} \neq \varnothing$ do
while $\Sigma$ ' admits a reduction pair $(\sigma, T)$ do
$V \leftarrow V \cup\{(\sigma, T)\}$
$\Sigma^{\prime} \leftarrow \Sigma^{\prime} \backslash\{\sigma, T\}$
end while

Let $\eta$ be a top simplex in $\Sigma^{\prime}$

$$
\begin{aligned}
& A \leftarrow A \cup\{\eta\} \\
& \Sigma^{\prime} \leftarrow \Sigma^{\prime} \backslash\{\eta\}
\end{aligned}
$$


end while

## Discrete Morse Theory

## Gradient through Reductions: <br> [Benedetti et al. 2014]

Input: $\Sigma$ simplicial complex
Output: $V$ gradient vector field, A set of critical simplices

Set $\Sigma^{\prime} \leftarrow \Sigma, V \leftarrow \varnothing, A \leftarrow \varnothing$
while $\Sigma^{\prime} \neq \varnothing$ do
while $\Sigma$ ' admits a reduction pair $(\sigma, T)$ do
$V \leftarrow V \cup\{(\sigma, T)\}$
$\Sigma^{\prime} \leftarrow \Sigma^{\prime} \backslash\{\sigma, T\}$
end while

Let $\eta$ be a top simplex in $\Sigma^{\prime}$

$$
\begin{aligned}
& A \leftarrow A \cup\{\eta\} \\
& \Sigma^{\prime} \leftarrow \Sigma^{\prime} \backslash\{\eta\}
\end{aligned}
$$


end while

## Discrete Morse Theory

## Gradient through Reductions: <br> [Benedetti et al. 2014]

Input: $\Sigma$ simplicial complex
Output: $V$ gradient vector field, A set of critical simplices

Set $\Sigma^{\prime} \leftarrow \Sigma, V \leftarrow \varnothing, A \leftarrow \varnothing$
while $\Sigma^{\prime} \neq \varnothing$ do
while $\Sigma$ ' admits a reduction pair $(\sigma, T)$ do
$V \leftarrow V \cup\{(\sigma, T)\}$
$\Sigma^{\prime} \leftarrow \Sigma^{\prime} \backslash\{\sigma, T\}$
end while

Let $\eta$ be a top simplex in $\Sigma^{\prime}$

$$
\begin{aligned}
& A \leftarrow A \cup\{\eta\} \\
& \Sigma^{\prime} \leftarrow \Sigma^{\prime} \backslash\{\eta\}
\end{aligned}
$$


end while

## Discrete Morse Theory

## Gradient through Reductions: <br> [Benedetti et al. 2014]

Input: $\sum$ simplicial complex
Output: $V$ gradient vector field, A set of critical simplices

Set $\Sigma^{\prime} \leftarrow \Sigma, V \leftarrow \varnothing, A \leftarrow \varnothing$
while $\Sigma^{\prime} \neq \varnothing$ do
while $\Sigma$ ' admits a reduction pair $(\sigma, T)$ do
$V \leftarrow V \cup\{(\sigma, T)\}$
$\Sigma^{\prime} \leftarrow \Sigma^{\prime} \backslash\{\sigma, T\}$
end while

Let $\eta$ be a top simplex in $\Sigma^{\prime}$

$$
\begin{aligned}
& A \leftarrow A \cup\{\eta\} \\
& \Sigma^{\prime} \leftarrow \Sigma^{\prime} \backslash\{\eta\}
\end{aligned}
$$


end while

## Discrete Morse Theory

## Gradient through Reductions: <br> [Benedetti et al. 2014]

Input: $\Sigma$ simplicial complex
Output: $V$ gradient vector field, A set of critical simplices

Set $\Sigma^{\prime} \leftarrow \Sigma, V \leftarrow \varnothing, A \leftarrow \varnothing$
while $\Sigma^{\prime} \neq \varnothing$ do
while $\Sigma$ ' admits a reduction pair $(\sigma, T)$ do
$V \leftarrow V \cup\{(\sigma, T)\}$
$\Sigma^{\prime} \leftarrow \Sigma^{\prime} \backslash\{\sigma, T\}$
end while

Let $\eta$ be a top simplex in $\Sigma^{\prime}$

$$
\begin{aligned}
& A \leftarrow A \cup\{\eta\} \\
& \Sigma^{\prime} \leftarrow \Sigma^{\prime} \backslash\{\eta\}
\end{aligned}
$$


end while

## Discrete Morse Theory

## Gradient through Coreductions:

[Harker et al. 2014]

Input: $\sum$ simplicial complex
Output: $V$ gradient vector field, A set of critical simplices

Set $\Sigma^{\prime} \leftarrow \Sigma, V \leftarrow \varnothing, A \leftarrow \varnothing$
while $\sum^{\prime} \neq \varnothing$ do
while $\Sigma$ ' admits a coreduction pair $(\sigma, \mathbf{T})$ do
$V \leftarrow V \cup\{(\sigma, T)\}$
$\Sigma^{\prime} \leftarrow \Sigma^{\prime} \backslash\{\sigma, T\}$
end while

Let $\eta$ be a free simplex in $\Sigma$ '

$$
\begin{aligned}
& A \leftarrow A \cup\{\eta\} \\
& \Sigma^{\prime} \leftarrow \Sigma^{\prime} \backslash\{\eta\}
\end{aligned}
$$


end while

## Discrete Morse Theory

## Gradient through Coreductions:

[Harker et al. 2014]

Input: $\sum$ simplicial complex
Output: $V$ gradient vector field, A set of critical simplices

Set $\Sigma^{\prime} \leftarrow \Sigma, V \leftarrow \varnothing, A \leftarrow \varnothing$
while $\sum^{\prime} \neq \varnothing$ do
while $\Sigma$ ' admits a coreduction pair $(\sigma, \mathbf{T})$ do
$V \leftarrow V \cup\{(\sigma, T)\}$
$\Sigma^{\prime} \leftarrow \Sigma^{\prime} \backslash\{\sigma, T\}$
end while

Let $\eta$ be a free simplex in $\Sigma$ '

$$
\begin{aligned}
& A \leftarrow A \cup\{\eta\} \\
& \Sigma^{\prime} \leftarrow \Sigma^{\prime} \backslash\{\eta\}
\end{aligned}
$$


end while

## Discrete Morse Theory

## Gradient through Coreductions:

[Harker et al. 2014]

Input: $\sum$ simplicial complex
Output: $V$ gradient vector field, A set of critical simplices

Set $\Sigma^{\prime} \leftarrow \Sigma, V \leftarrow \varnothing, A \leftarrow \varnothing$
while $\sum^{\prime} \neq \varnothing$ do
while $\Sigma$ ' admits a coreduction pair $(\sigma, \mathbf{T})$ do
$V \leftarrow V \cup\{(\sigma, T)\}$
$\Sigma^{\prime} \leftarrow \Sigma^{\prime} \backslash\{\sigma, T\}$
end while

Let $\eta$ be a free simplex in $\Sigma$ '

$$
\begin{aligned}
& A \leftarrow A \cup\{\eta\} \\
& \Sigma^{\prime} \leftarrow \Sigma^{\prime} \backslash\{\eta\}
\end{aligned}
$$


end while

## Discrete Morse Theory

## Gradient through Coreductions:

[Harker et al. 2014]

Input: $\sum$ simplicial complex
Output: $V$ gradient vector field, A set of critical simplices

Set $\Sigma^{\prime} \leftarrow \Sigma, V \leftarrow \varnothing, A \leftarrow \varnothing$
while $\sum^{\prime} \neq \varnothing$ do
while $\Sigma$ ' admits a coreduction pair $(\sigma, \mathbf{T})$ do
$V \leftarrow V \cup\{(\sigma, T)\}$
$\Sigma^{\prime} \leftarrow \Sigma^{\prime} \backslash\{\sigma, T\}$
end while

Let $\eta$ be a free simplex in $\Sigma$ '

$$
\begin{aligned}
& A \leftarrow A \cup\{\eta\} \\
& \Sigma^{\prime} \leftarrow \Sigma^{\prime} \backslash\{\eta\}
\end{aligned}
$$


end while

## Discrete Morse Theory

## Gradient through Coreductions:

[Harker et al. 2014]

Input: $\sum$ simplicial complex
Output: $V$ gradient vector field, A set of critical simplices

Set $\Sigma^{\prime} \leftarrow \Sigma, V \leftarrow \varnothing, A \leftarrow \varnothing$
while $\sum^{\prime} \neq \varnothing$ do
while $\Sigma$ ' admits a coreduction pair $(\sigma, \mathbf{T})$ do
$V \leftarrow V \cup\{(\sigma, T)\}$
$\Sigma^{\prime} \leftarrow \Sigma^{\prime} \backslash\{\sigma, T\}$
end while

Let $\eta$ be a free simplex in $\Sigma$ '

$$
\begin{aligned}
& A \leftarrow A \cup\{\eta\} \\
& \Sigma^{\prime} \leftarrow \Sigma^{\prime} \backslash\{\eta\}
\end{aligned}
$$


end while

## Discrete Morse Theory

## Gradient through Coreductions:

[Harker et al. 2014]

Input: $\sum$ simplicial complex
Output: $V$ gradient vector field, A set of critical simplices

Set $\Sigma^{\prime} \leftarrow \Sigma, V \leftarrow \varnothing, A \leftarrow \varnothing$
while $\sum^{\prime} \neq \varnothing$ do
while $\Sigma$ ' admits a coreduction pair $(\sigma, \mathbf{T})$ do
$V \leftarrow V \cup\{(\sigma, T)\}$
$\Sigma^{\prime} \leftarrow \Sigma^{\prime} \backslash\{\sigma, T\}$
end while

Let $\eta$ be a free simplex in $\Sigma$ '

$$
\begin{aligned}
& A \leftarrow A \cup\{\eta\} \\
& \Sigma^{\prime} \leftarrow \Sigma^{\prime} \backslash\{\eta\}
\end{aligned}
$$


end while

## Discrete Morse Theory

## Gradient through Coreductions:

[Harker et al. 2014]

Input: $\sum$ simplicial complex
Output: $V$ gradient vector field, A set of critical simplices

Set $\Sigma^{\prime} \leftarrow \Sigma, V \leftarrow \varnothing, A \leftarrow \varnothing$
while $\Sigma^{\prime} \neq \varnothing$ do
while $\Sigma$ ' admits a coreduction pair $(\sigma, \mathbf{T})$ do
$V \leftarrow V \cup\{(\sigma, T)\}$
$\Sigma^{\prime} \leftarrow \Sigma^{\prime} \backslash\{\sigma, T\}$
end while

Let $\eta$ be a free simplex in $\Sigma$ '

$$
\begin{aligned}
& A \leftarrow A \cup\{\eta\} \\
& \Sigma^{\prime} \leftarrow \Sigma^{\prime} \backslash\{\eta\}
\end{aligned}
$$


end while

## Discrete Morse Theory

## Proposition.

Both the algorithms produce a Forman gradient on $\Sigma$
Which approach is able to compute a Forman gradient with less critical simplices?

## Discrete Morse Theory

## Proposition.

Both the algorithms produce a Forman gradient on $\Sigma$
Which approach is able to compute a Forman gradient with less critical simplices?

Reduction-based and coreduction-based approaches are equivalent
Theorem.
Any Forman gradient $V$ on $\Sigma$ produced by a reduction-based algorithm can be obtained through a coreduction-based algorithm; and the converse is also true

## Discrete Morse Theory

## Proof's guidelines: (from reduction-based to coreduction-based)

+ Consider a simplicial complex $\Sigma$ and run the reduction-based approach on it
+ Take the sequence of reduction pairs and top simplex removals operated by the algorithm
+ Reverse the order of the sequence: this new sequence represents for $\Sigma$ a performable sequence of coreduction pairs and free simplex removals



## Discrete Morse Theory

## Proof's guidelines: (from reduction-based to coreduction-based)

+ Consider a simplicial complex $\Sigma$ and run the reduction-based approach on it
+ Take the sequence of reduction pairs and top simplex removals operated by the algorithm
+ Reverse the order of the sequence: this new sequence represents for $\Sigma$ a performable sequence of coreduction pairs and free simplex removals



## Discrete Morse Theory

## Proof's guidelines: (from reduction-based to coreduction-based)

+ Consider a simplicial complex $\Sigma$ and run the reduction-based approach on it
+ Take the sequence of reduction pairs and top simplex removals operated by the algorithm
+ Reverse the order of the sequence: this new sequence represents for $\Sigma$ a performable sequence of coreduction pairs and free simplex removals



## Discrete Morse Theory

## Proof's guidelines: (from reduction-based to coreduction-based)

+ Consider a simplicial complex $\Sigma$ and run the reduction-based approach on it
+ Take the sequence of reduction pairs and top simplex removals operated by the algorithm
+ Reverse the order of the sequence: this new sequence represents for $\Sigma$ a performable sequence of coreduction pairs and free simplex removals



## Discrete Morse Theory

## Proof's guidelines: (from reduction-based to coreduction-based)

+ Consider a simplicial complex $\Sigma$ and run the reduction-based approach on it
+ Take the sequence of reduction pairs and top simplex removals operated by the algorithm
+ Reverse the order of the sequence: this new sequence represents for $\Sigma$ a performable sequence of coreduction pairs and free simplex removals



## Discrete Morse Theory

## Proof's guidelines: (from reduction-based to coreduction-based)

+ Consider a simplicial complex $\Sigma$ and run the reduction-based approach on it
+ Take the sequence of reduction pairs and top simplex removals operated by the algorithm
+ Reverse the order of the sequence: this new sequence represents for $\Sigma$ a performable sequence of coreduction pairs and free simplex removals



## Discrete Morse Theory

## Proof's guidelines: (from reduction-based to coreduction-based)

+ Consider a simplicial complex $\Sigma$ and run the reduction-based approach on it
+ Take the sequence of reduction pairs and top simplex removals operated by the algorithm
+ Reverse the order of the sequence: this new sequence represents for $\Sigma$ a performable sequence of coreduction pairs and free simplex removals



## Discrete Morse Theory

## Interleaved Approach:

Another class of approaches interleaving reductions and coreductions has been considered
Proposition.
Any interleaved approach produces a Forman gradient on $\Sigma$

## Discrete Morse Theory

## Interleaved Approach:

Another class of approaches interleaving reductions and coreductions has been considered

## Proposition.

Any interleaved approach produces a Forman gradient on $\Sigma$

## Each interleaved approach has equivalent capabilities

## Theorem.

Any Forman gradient $V$ on $\Sigma$ produced by an interleaved algorithm can be obtained through a reduction-based algorithm or, equivalently, through a coreduction-based algorithm

## Outline



## Thank you

Ulderico Fugacci
TU Kaiserslautern, Dept. of Computer Science

